

XAVIER BECERRA  
 Attorney General of California  
 ANTHONY R. HAKL  
 Supervising Deputy Attorney General  
 GABRIELLE D. BOUTIN, SBN 267308  
 ANNA T. FERRARI, SBN 261579  
 TODD GRABARSKY, SBN 286999  
 R. MATTHEW WISE, SBN 238485  
 NOREEN P. SKELLY, SBN 186135  
 Deputy Attorneys General  
 1300 I Street, Suite 125  
 P.O. Box 944255  
 Sacramento, CA 94244-2550  
 Telephone: (916) 210-6053  
 Fax: (916) 324-8835  
 E-mail: Gabrielle.Boutin@doj.ca.gov  
*Attorneys for State of California, by and through  
 Attorney General Xavier Becerra*

*(Additional counsel listed on signature panel)*

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

**STATE OF CALIFORNIA, by and through  
 Attorney General Xavier Becerra;  
 COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES; CITY OF  
 LOS ANGELES; CITY OF FREMONT;  
 CITY OF LONG BEACH; CITY OF  
 OAKLAND; CITY OF STOCKTON,**

Plaintiff,

**v.**

**WILBUR L. ROSS, JR., in his official  
 capacity as Secretary of the U.S.  
 Department of Commerce; U.S.  
 DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE; RON  
 JARMIN, in his official capacity as Acting  
 Director of the U.S. Census Bureau; U.S.  
 CENSUS BUREAU; DOES 1-100,**

Defendants.

3:18-cv-01865

**JOINT STIPULATION AND  
~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER REGARDING  
 EVIDENCE RELATING TO  
 PLAINTIFFS' EXPERT WITNESSES  
 DRS. HERMANN HABERMANN AND  
 LISA HANDLEY**

Dept: 3  
 Judge: The Honorable Richard G.  
 Seeborg  
 Trial Date: January 7, 2019  
 Action Filed: March 26, 2018

**JOINT STIPULATION REGARDING EVIDENCE RELATING TO TESTIMONY OF  
PLAINTIFFS' EXPERT WITNESSES DRs. HERMANN HABERMANN AND LISA  
HANDLEY**

To promote efficiency and preserve judicial resources, plaintiff State of California and defendants U.S. Department of Commerce, Wilbur Ross, Jr., U.S. Census Bureau, and Ron Jarmin have reached an agreement regarding certain trial exhibits that relate to the trial testimony of plaintiff's expert witnesses Drs. Hermann Habermann and Lisa Handley. The Parties hereby stipulate as follows:

1. Drs. Habermann and Handley previously testified as expert witnesses on behalf of the plaintiffs in *State of New York, et al. v. United States Department of Commerce, et al.*, pending before the U.S. District Court for the Southern District of California, Case No. 1:18-cv-02921.

2. The trial testimony of Dr. Habermann in the above-captioned matter, consisting of a trial affidavit and trial testimony from the *State of New York, et al.* matter, is set forth at PTX-821 and PTX-820, respectively. These exhibits were admitted into evidence on January 14, 2019.

2. The trial testimony of Dr. Handley in the above-captioned matter, consisting of trial testimony from the *State of New York, et al.* matter, is set forth at PTX-819. This exhibit was admitted into evidence on January 14, 2019.

3. The following trial exhibits relating to the testimony of Dr. Habermann in the above-captioned matter shall be admitted into evidence: PTX-262, PTX-267, PTX-268, PTX-269, PTX-610, PTX-611, PTX-612, PTX-613, PTX-618. These documents shall be admitted separate from and in addition to those exhibits admitted or otherwise identified on the record during the January 14, 2019, trial session.

4. Drs. Handley's and Habermann's testimony in the *State of New York, et al.* matter contains references to trial exhibits from that matter, which have been numbered separately as exhibits in the above-captioned matter. The parties acknowledge and agree that the table attached as **Exhibit A** to this stipulation accurately cross-references trial exhibits relating to Drs.

Habermann's and Handley's trial testimony from the *State of New York, et al.* matter with the corresponding exhibits from the above-captioned matter.

**IT IS SO STIPULATED.**

Dated: January 17, 2019

XAVIER BECERRA  
Attorney General of California  
ANTHONY R. HAKL  
Supervising Deputy Attorney General  
GABRIELLE D. BOUTIN  
ANNA T. FERRARI  
TODD GRABARSKY  
NOREEN P. SKELLY  
R. MATTHEW WISE  
Deputy Attorneys General

/s/ Anna T. Ferrari  
ANNA T. FERRARI  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California, by and  
through Attorney General Xavier Becerra*

Dated: January 17, 2019

JOSEPH H. HUNT  
Assistant Attorney General  
  
BRETT A. SHUMATE  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

CARLOTTA P. WELLS  
Assistant Branch Director

/s/ Carlotta P. Wells  
KATE BAILEY  
MARSHA EDNEY  
STEPHEN EHRLICH  
CAROL FEDERIGHI  
Trial Attorneys  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
1100 L Street NW  
Washington, DC 20530  
Phone: (202) 514-9239  
Email: carlotta.wells@usdoj.gov  
*Attorneys for Defendants*

**FILER'S ATTESTATION**

Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), regarding signatures, I hereby attest that concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained from all signatories above.

Dated: January 17, 2019


/s/ Anna T. Ferrari  
ANNA T. FERRARI

**~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER**

Based on the parties' Stipulation to Admit Evidence Relating to Testimony of Plaintiffs' Expert Witness Dr. Hermann Habermann, and good cause appearing, the following trial exhibits shall be admitted into evidence at trial in the above-captioned case: PTX-262, PTX-267, PTX-268, PTX-269, PTX-610, PTX-611, PTX-612, PTX-613, PTX-618.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: 1/18/19

  
HON. RICHARD SEEBORG  
United States District Judge